

BOCA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD WOMAN'S CLUB ROOM BOCA GRANDE COMMUNITY CENTER 131 FIRST STREET WEST, BOCA GRANDE, FL 33921

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 11, 2012 10:00 AM

AGENDA

- 1. Call to Order/Roll Call/Review of Affidavit of Publication
- 2. Approval of Minutes March 22, 2012
- 3. Public Hearing on Special Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Cases (For public review, plans for the COA cases are available at the Reference Library, Boca Grande Community Center, 131 First Street West, Boca Grande, starting April 4, 2012.) <u>Note</u>: A summary of the zoning relief requests is provided for informational purposes only. The Lee County Zoning Division will make a determination after the Historic Preservation Board renders its decision.
 - A. <u>COA2012-00048-</u> Johann Fust Community Library, 1040 and 1041 10th St W., Boca Grande, FL 33921

The project entails the rehabilitation of buildings in the Fust library campus and improved handicap accessibility.

Relief in the RS-2 (Residential Single-Family) zoning district from the Lee County Land Development Code as follows:

- 1. Relief from LDC Section 34-1744 (b) (2) a.i. which requires all fencing located between a street right-of-way or easement and the minimum 25 foot street setback line not to exceed a height of 3 feet, to permit an existing walls 7 foot 3 inches to 10 feet high with gate between a street right-of-way or easement and the minimum street setback, 0 feet from the street right-of-way (Gasparilla Road and Tenth Street).
- 2. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 which requires the minimum required rear setback of 20 feet on the south property line, to 0 feet to bring the existing structure into compliance.
- 3. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 and LDC Section 34-2192(a) which requires the minimum required street setback of 25 feet from Gasparilla Road and Tenth Street on the east and north property lines, to 0 feet to bring the existing structure into compliance.
- 4. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 and LDC Section 34-2192(a) which requires the minimum required street setback of 25 feet from Tenth Street on the north property lines, to 21 feet 10 inches to bring the existing stairs and ramp into compliance.

(OVER)

- 5. Relief from LDC Sections 34-2015, 34-2016 and 34-2017, except handicapped parking space requirements, from parking lot design standards, to bring existing parking spaces into compliance.
- B. <u>COA2011-00141 Gilcrest LLC, 331 Gilchrist Ave Boca Grande, FL 33921</u> The project entails the construction of a new single family residence at the corner of Gilchrist Ave and 3rd St W.

Relief in the RS-1 (Residential Single Family) zoning district from the Lee County Land Development Code from:

- 1. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 and LDC Section 34-2192(a) which requires a 25-foot street setback from Third Street to permit a setback of 20 feet from the southerly property line, for proposed porch and stairs.
- 2. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 and LDC Section 34-2192(a) which requires a 25-foot street setback from Gilchrest Avenue to permit a setback of 20 feet from the easterly property line, for proposed porch and stairs.

C. <u>COA2012-00026 Middle Third LLC, 307 West 3rd St W., Boca Grande, FL</u> <u>33921</u>

Remodel existing house and expand with addition and pool.

Relief in the RS-1 (Residential Single Family) zoning district from the Lee County Land Development Code from:

- 1. Relief from LDC Section 34-1744 (b) (2) a.i. which requires all fencing located between a street right-of-way or easement and the minimum 25 foot street setback line not to exceed a height of 3 feet, for proposed walls with gate 6 feet in height, between a street right-of-way or easement and the minimum street setback, 5 feet from the southerly property line (Street right-of-way of Third Street).
- 2. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 which requires the minimum required side setback of 7.5 feet on the west property line, to 5 feet to bring the existing structure into compliance.
- 3. Relief from LDC Section 34-695 and LDC Section 34-2192(a) which requires the minimum required street setback of 25 feet from Third Street on the south property line, to 8 feet 1 inch to bring the existing structure into compliance.

4. Items by the Public; Committee Members; Staff

5. Adjournment – Next Meeting Date: to be determined

Any person appealing a decision made at this hearing must ensure a record of the proceedings is made. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, Reasonable Accommodations will be made upon request. If you are in need of a Reasonable Accommodation or would like additional information, please contact Janet Miller at 533-8583. To receive agendas by e-mail, contact <u>imiller@leegov.com</u>



HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Lee County Planning Division, PO Box 398, Fort Myers, FL 33902 Phone: (239) 533-8585 / FAX: (239) 485-8319

COA 2012-00048

COA No. COA	De	signation No. HD90	-05-01	Date Filed:	March 27, 2012
X Contributing	Non-(Contributing	Individual D	esignation	Not Historical
Name of Project: Re	novations a	Remodeling	to The Joh	ann Fust	Community Library
Location: <u>1040 &</u> STRAP No.: ^{#144}	3200100036.	0010 and #14	4320010003	5.0020	
Name of Applicant or (*All correspondence with I					PA
Address: 1373	5th Street	5			
City, State, Zip:	Sarasota,	Florida 3423	6		
Phone Number:	(941)366-91	61	Fax Numbe	er: (941)36	5-0902
Email Address:	mepstein@s	seibertarchte	cts.com		
Name of Historic Dist	ict (if applicable):	Boca Grande	Historic	District	
Check all that apply:		Archaeological	4		andscape Feature
Project Description (d	escribe all work p	roposed):			
⊠ Alteration □	Demolition X	New Construction	Reconstructi	on 🛛 Rehabi	litation 🔲 Relocation
Narrative. Alte	rations to	existing fa	cilities to	o provide	accessibility and
					sting finishes and
Comp	onents and	new constru	ction of a	storage s	shed.
Change in Use: 🔀 No If yes, explain.	D 🗌 Yes				

Has a development order or exemption been applied for prior to or concurrent with this application? INO X Yes If yes, explain. A Limited Review Development Order (LDO) is applied for.

**** FOR STAFF USE ONLY ****			
Date Issued:	APPROVED DENIED*		
Certified by:	KBGASAV EM		
*Explanation attached			
	WAR 2 1 2012		

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

NET SQUARE FOOTAGE OF USABLE AREAS

AREA	EXISTING SF.	PROPOSED SF.
Staff areas	240sf	245sf
Main library	592sf	592sf
Children's library	245sf	260sf
Storage areas	948sf	161sf
Media library	Osf	502sf
Reading room	Osf	151sf
Display	Osf	90sf
Totals	2025sf	2001sf

GROSS INTERIOR SQUARE FOOTAGE AS PROPOSED = 2934Sf (measured to outside face of exterior walls)







Copyright ©2011 Pictometry International Corp.

FUST LIBRARY NORTH ELEVATION ON 10th St. FRONT ELEVATION ON 10th St.



Copyright ©2011 Pictometry International Corp.

TUST LIBRARY SOUTH ELEVATION AND PARKING LOT ACROSS THE STREET



FUST LIBRARY EAST ELEVATION FRONTAGE ON GASPARILLA 2D



Copyright ©2011 Pictometry International Corp.

FUST LIBRARY WEST ELEUMITION

BOCA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

STAFF REPORT –updated April 5, 2012

TYPE OF CASE: Special Certificate of Appropriateness

CASE NUMBER: COA 2012 00048 -- Johann Fust Community Library, 1040 and 1041 10th St W., Boca Grande Fl 33921

HEARING DATE: April 11, 2012

SUMMARY

The proposal calls for the rehabilitation of structures and improved handicap accessibility to a contributing property in the Boca Grande Historic District HD 90-05-01. Staff analyzed the project for compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The STRAP numbers are 14 43 20 01 00035 0020 and 14 43 20 01 00036 0010; the address is 1040 and 1041 10th St W. in Boca Grande.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Existing Conditions:

Noted architect Henry Richardson Shepley designed the island's Johann Fust Community Library, which was donated by Roger and Louise Amory and dedicated in 1950. The library campus is located one block from the Gulf of Mexico and includes: a parking lot on the north side of 10th St., the Fust library and associated outbuildings on the south side of 10th St and a cottage to the west of the Fust library buildings.

<u>The Fust library and associated outbuildings</u> were built in a contemporary building style with elements of the Spanish Eclectic style. The buildings feature a variety of roof heights, a loggia and partially enclosed patios and gardens. The buildings and wall fences are located at the perimeter of the site surrounding a lush interior courtyard.

The Fust library building is a 2-story rectangular building fronting on 10th St. The first floor accommodates the library room, the entry arcade, the check out area and the staff office. The second floor accommodates a living unit originally intended for the librarian.

The Fust library building features a large hip roof with white, flat clay tiles. The walls are covered with smooth stucco. The library building has two chimneys: on the east elevation the building has a large exterior chimney and on the west elevation an interior chimney. In addition the loggia has an exterior chimney.

In front of the library building -- to the northeast side – is a tall wall fence shielding a handicap ramp. The front elevation of the Fust library building is recessed behind this tall wall fence and accessed by a central set of stairs leading to the huge cypress front doors – (the design of the doors mirrors the design of doors at a Mosque in Istanbul). The doors open to a breezeway leading to an interior courtyard. The steps, front door surrounds and breezeway walls feature Florida Keys limestone embedded with coral formations. The second floor of the Fust library features ribbons of casement windows

The Fust library has a small two-story rectangular wing on the rear (south) accommodating a mechanical room and bathroom on the first floor and open porch on the second floor. Additionally there is a small, single story, flat roofed wing on the east side accommodating the children's library.

<u>Garage building:</u> To the rear of the lot on the east side by Gasparilla Rd is a two car garage featuring two single garage doors. The garage features smooth stucco walls and parapet walls. A long, smooth stucco wall fence featuring variable heights runs along the east side of the property joining the fence wall on the front to the garage at the rear.

<u>The Loggia</u> Behind the Fust library building and on the west side is a single story loggia which opens to the interior courtyard. It features a white flat, clay tile gable roof supported by columns on the east side and by a smooth stucco wall with an exterior chimney on the west side.

<u>The Storage Building and Garden Shed:</u> The loggia terminates at a small storage building which features walls, doors and roofs to match the rest of the building. Next to the storage room is a garden shed with a roof made of wood slats.

The Proposal

The current proposal calls for moving the library resources at the Reference Room of the Boca Grande Community Center to the Fust Library. Lee County will fund the library resources. The Johann Community Library of Boca Grande Inc. will maintain the ownership of the building, grounds and endowment and will be responsible for operating and maintenance expenses of the buildings and grounds.

To accommodate the county operated facility the following changes are proposed to the Fust library building; these changes do not require major, exterior architectural work:

- The main library room would be upgraded (improved ceilings, lighting, shelves etc).
- The check out area would become a display area.
- The staff office would become a reading room highlighting the fireplace.
- The children's library would become staff and volunteer offices.

The alterations requiring exterior architectural changes are the following:

<u>Handicap Accessibility:</u> Currently there is a handicap ramp behind the front (northeast) fence walls. The ramp is accessed from the east side by Gasparilla Rd. and provides access to the landing area before the front doors. This ramp does not meet code and will be re-designed.

The proposal calls for installing a handicap parking space just west of the main library building and a concrete sidewalk connecting this handicap parking space to the re-designed handicap ramp. While the handicap ramp would continue to be located behind the northeast fence wall, it would be accessed from the west side and incorporate a switchback to facilitate wheelchair travel to the new staff and volunteer offices and to the main entrance at the front of the Fust building.

Garage to become the media room:

The garage is will be altered for adaptive re-use as the media room. However, the proposed alterations respect the original use of the building as a garage structure. Currently the building features a flat roof recessed behind parapet walls. While the parapet walls will be preserved a new flat roof will be installed. It will protrude roughly 2 ½ ft above the highest part parapet wall and feature ribbons of clerestory windows that will let natural light into the media room.

On the east side the overhead garage doors opening to Gasparilla Rd. will be replaced with a vertical wood board siding in a pattern to match the overhead doors shown in the original construction documents.

On the west side, the existing bathroom will be retrofitted to accommodate a storage area. The existing single garage door is roughly flush with the west elevation and provides access to the garage from the garden. This garage door will be removed and in its place a small porch (roughly 6-ft deep and 8-ft long) will be incised under the building's roof. The incised porch will terminate at a new entrance door and a new wall. Next to this porch a new area with a footprint of roughly 7-ft by 14-ft will be created in the building accommodate a handicap accessible bathroom and a mechanical/electrical room. Patrons going to the media library will enter the incised porch area and from there access either the entrance to the library or the handicap accessible bathroom.

Among the principal changes to the interior are: new tile flooring, installation of drywall and insulation, custom shelving, lighting and electrical, data distribution and HVAC systems.

<u>The Storage Building and Garden Shed to become the Children's Library and Secret Garden:</u> The storage building next to the loggia will altered for adaptive re-use as the Children's Library. The major exterior change proposed is replacing the existing doors with new doors. Among the interior changes proposed are new tile flooring, insulation/drywall, lighting and electrical, data distribution and HVAC systems. New custom shelving is also proposed.

The garden shed will become the Secret Garden and will be associated with the new Children's Library. The principal changes proposed include a new wood deck and translucent roof panels over the existing wood slat roof.

New Storage Building

Outside the main library campus, at the rear of the cottage the proposal calls for a new shed building with a footprint of roughly 10-ft by 20-ft and height of roughly $12 \frac{1}{2}$ ft. The building will feature a metal gable roof with painted board and batten wood siding.

Parking lot upgrades:

The existing parking lot will be upgraded with parking bumpers and landscaping.

Staff believes this is a well thought out project allowing for continued library use of the existing facilities at the Fust library.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

In evaluating the Secretary of the Interior's Standards also refer to the discussion above.

1. <u>A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.</u>

The proposal will allow the property to be continued to be used as a library.

2. <u>The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved.</u> <u>The removal of historic</u> <u>materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.</u>

As noted above the character of the property is being retained and preserved. The proposal avoids the removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize the property.

- 3. <u>Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use.</u> Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or <u>architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.</u> The changes proposed do not create a sense of false historical development. .
- 4. <u>Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their</u> <u>own right shall be retained and preserved.</u>

The principal characteristics of the Fust library complex buildings are being retained and preserved.

5. *Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*

The simplicity of design and the original materials, mass and scale of the building will be preserved.

- 6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence. N/A
- 7 <u>Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials</u> <u>shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the</u> <u>gentlest means possible.</u> N/A
- 8 Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken. N/A
- 9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The major alterations are: 1) the removal of the garage door facing the garden to install a small incised porch providing access to the media library and to a handicap accessible bathroom and 2) the change of the roof over the existing garage so it can be adaptively re-used as a media library. These changes do not destroy historic materials and are compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of the property and its environment. They are easily differentiated from the existing buildings building.

10. <u>New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that</u> if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

There are no new additions planned.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board:

- Approve the project as presented by the applicant
- Make a finding that the proposed project has been designated under Chapter 22 of the LDC and on the basis of staff analysis, the proposed project that as approved is in compliance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Chapter 22 of the LDC.



North (front) on 10th St. and East (side) on Gasparilla Rd elevations of Fust Library

North (front) of adjoining cottage to the West





Library parking lot across 10th St.



North (front) elevation – note walled-in courtyard by the street for the handicap ramp



East (side) note walled-in courtyard for the handicap ramp



Handicap ramp inside the walled-in courtyard

Handicap ramp inside the walled-in courtyard





Access to the children's Library from the handicap ramp area



East side

East side





Garage doors on the East side



Interior Courtyard looking North to the main Bldg



Interior Courtyard looking West to the loggia



Shell-shaped fountain in the courtyard's center piece

Interior courtyard from the loggia



Interior courtyard looking South from the main building



Interior courtyard looking South past the vegetation – to the left is the garage (new media room) and to the right is storage (new children's library)

Inside the garage – note the two garage doors that open to Gasparilla Rd





Garage door providing access from the courtyard to the garage



Door to the storage are (new children's library) and the garden shed (the new secret garden)

Interior of the storage area





Interior of the garden shed



Rear of West (side) elevation – proposed detached storage shed will be located in the open area



Mulch bins in the rear yard



Art Alliance to hold 'A Touch of Red' show this weekend

STAFF REPORT

:_a.m. to:4:n.m.

The Boca Grande Art Alliance will present "A Touch of Red," the group's Valentine's Day show. The opening reception is tonight, Friday, Feb. 10 from 5 to 7:30 p.m. Show hours are Saturday and Sunday from 10

Reference Room, Fust Library to combine forces

BY ALICE GORMAN

When we heard of a plan to combine the Lee County Reference Room with the Johann Fust Community Library, we asked the Fust Library's Vice President, Alice Gorman, for her input. This article was written by her, and represents information from both librarys' staff.

Everyone in Boca Grande loves the Johann Fust Community Library. The building, with its gracious gardens on 10th Street that was given to our community by the Roger Amory family, is an institution that has continued to be a place of serenity and literary resources since

BY MARCY SHORTUSE

1949.

'World's Richest' plans finalized

Last winter, the board circulated a survey in front of the Boca Grande Post Office that asked the community for its thoughts and opinions on our library system. The results that came back gave us a clear path to the answer to the problem.

An overwhelming number of people said that, although they loved the Fust library, they mainly got their books and DVD's, and used the resources, including computers, at the Lee County Reference Room.

The main question was "Why do we have two libraries in Boca Grande?" and "Is there any way that the libraries can combine?"

Lew Hastings, the executive direc-

r of the Chamber gives nartia

For the past year, the board of the Fust Library has been working on an agreement with Lee County Library Systems to form a partnership.

The idea that is still in the process of final negotiations is to move the library resources of the Reference Room at the Community Center to the Fust Library.

The same extensive and efficient resources will continue to be funded by Lee County (tax dollars from Boca Grande). The Fust library will maintain full ownership of the building and grounds and the endowment. It will continue to be responsible for ongo-



BOCA BEACON - February 10, 2012

Libraries

from PAGE 1

ing operating and maintenance expenses for the buildings and grounds.

For the past 10 years, as Lee County has provided its extensive and efficient library services to the Reference room at the Community Center, the Fust Library has been in decline.

The Fust Library will raise the necessary funds to repair and renovate the buildings to bring them up to date and to accommodate the current library operations at the Reference Room. The library buildings need repair and renovation. Circulation, as well as the contributions, have been diminishing steadily. What was the board of directors to do?

The space now used by the Reference Room at the Community Center would revert to supervision by Lee County Parks and Recreation for other usage by the Friends of the Community Center. Such an arrangement would serve everyone's needs. The Community Center is in urgent need of more space. The Fust Library, in partnership with

Lee County, would become the village's only library, and would serve Boca Grande in a way that would honor the founders' intent.

There are many libraries in Florida, as well as other states, that operate with this kind of public/private partnership. The Captiva Memorial Library, for example, is owned by the people of Captiva and is operated by Lee County Library Systems.

Also, there is written justification for this course of action in the Certificate of Incorporation of the Johann Fust Community Library. Under Article III, there is a statement: "The corporation may ... build, construct, equip and maintain such buildings, structures and rooms as may from time to time be necessary to meet its requirements or the exigencies of a complete and modern library."

It would not be possible today for the Fust Library to follow that guideline without the extensive resources of Lee County Library Systems. While our architect; Seibert and Co., is still at work to create the detailed drawings and documents that we need to proceed with our proposed plans, the following ideas will be incorporated:

• The existing 'stacks room' will be transformed from the musty, dusty space that it has become into a historically appropriate library space that honors our past and values our heritage;

• The children's library, currently behind the office, out-of-sight and outof-mind, will be relocated to the old potting shed and transformed into the Children's Library and Secret Garden – a wonderfully special place for children and families;

• A new technology center will be created in the old garage, transforming it into a state-of-the-art center for internet, e-books, and DVD's;

• All of the buildings and grounds will be made completely handicap accessible;

• and there will be a reading room where patrons can appreciate some of the rare books and artifacts of the Fust Community Library.

Upon completion of this project, the

Fust Library will be open all year, Monday through Friday, 9 a.m. to 5 p.m., and on Saturdays from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. It will be closed for all legal holidays,

It is the sincere hope of the board of directors of the Fust Library that there will be full support in the community for this exciting and innovative agreement.

This idea is not "change" in the traditional definition of making something new and different. It is a renovation and an enhancement of what already exists.

We believe that it will ensure a vibrant future for one of Boca Grande's most beloved institutions for the children and grandchildren of island residents, visitors, and those who work here. When the agreement is finalized, the board will begin a campaign to raise the funds to make it happen.

If anyone has any questions or suggestions, please contact a member of the board of directors of the Fust Library or Toni Vanover at the Lee County Reference Room.

selves. "Also, I was shown it is a time keeper, as the sun on its passage north fills its center around March 6, and once, a few minutes after the new year, I saw the half moon rise and fit perfectly in one of the inverted arches of the wall of the estate. I felt I was in the right place, at the right time, and my cup full. It also became the arch through which I had to leave, to (hopefully) mature in the world outside the garden, the paradise island."

Mariana said the characters that overlay the arch seem to be from Greek mythology, and they remind her of the figures on the vases.





from PAGE 1

ed a print portfolio of seven etchings for their public collection. She was curious about the particular. technique I use of overlaying the plates. I sometimes use up to five, or even more, overlays of different plates. They become layers of time, as the plates are instances or thoughts, ideas or words to make a visual sentence, a type of language." Mariana said she received a letter from "The

Page 18













The Johann Fust Community

REPAIR EDGE OF EXISTING STEP © THIS REPAIR EXISTING DOORS AND GRIND DOW STONE THRESHOLD TO IMPROVE ACCESSIE PROPOSED NORTH ELEVATION SCALE: 3/16" = 1'-0"	N
EXISTING NORTH ELEVATION SCALE: 3/16" = 1'-0"	P.A. All Rights Reserved 2012
Library Samuel C. Holladay AIA	A4.0 Sheet No.

FOR EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS WITH DIMENSIONS AND NOTES (SEE PROPOSED SITE PLAN ON SHEET A1.1 FOR LOCATION)

ROOF AREA ABOVE THE "SECRET GARDEN". ATTACH TO EXISTING ROOF BEAMS WITH A MINIMUM OF 1" CLEAR SPACE BETWEEN TRANSLUCENT PANELS AND COMPONENTS OF EXISTING WOOD SLAT ROOF -TYP.

GENERAL NOTES

1. ALL EQUIPMENT, PIPING, WIRING, CONDUIT, FASTENERS AND OTHER ATTACHMENT DEVICES THAT ARE NOT IN ACTIVE SERVICE AND ARE NOT A PART OF THE ORIGINAL CONSTRUCTION OF THE BUILDING, CIRCA 1950, ARE TO BE REMOVED FROM THE SURFACE OF BUILDING(S).

2. HOLES AND OTHER IMPERFECTIONS IN EXTERIOR WALLS AND FINISHES RESULTING FROM THE REMOVAL OF PIPING, WIRING, ETC., AS INDICATED ABOVE, ARE TO BE PATCHED AND REPAIRED.

3. DUE DILIGENCE AND CARE SHALL BE TAKEN TO ENSURE THAT THE ORIGINAL MATERIALS OF CONSTRUCTION, CIRCA 1950, ARE NOT DAMAGED OR REMOVED EXCEPT AS SPECIFICALLY INDICATED OTHERWISE.

4. ALL EXISTING PAINTED SURFACES ARE TO BE CLEANED AND REPAINTED. EXISTING UNPAINTED SURFACES ARE TO CLEANED AND ARE TO REMAIN UNPAINTED. THE ARCHITECT SHALL APPROVE ALL CLEANING METHODS PRIOR TO THE START OF CLEANING WORK FOR EACH DIFFERENT TYPE OF MATERIAL SUBSTRATE TO BE CLEANED.

5. ALL ROOF AREAS SHALL BE CLEANED AND RECOATED IN ACCORDANCE WITH ROOF COATING MANUFACTURER'S RECOMMENDATIONS AND WRITTEN INSTRUCTIONS.

6. DRAWINGS DO NOT DEPICT EXISTING VEGETATION. CARE SHALL BE TAKEN TO PROTECT EXISTING VEGETATION FROM DAMAGE DUE TO CONSTRUCTION OPERATIONS. WHERE REMOVAL OF VEGETATION IS REQUIRED IN ORDER TO ACCOMPLISH THE WORK INDICATED IN THESE DRAWINGS THE APPROVAL OF THE ARCHITECT IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO REMOVAL.

7. EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS ARE REPRESENTED PARALLEL AND PERPENDICULAR TO THE "MAIN BUILDING". OTHER STRUCTURES WHICH ARE NOT PARALLEL AND PERPENDICULAR TO THE "MAIN BUILDING" ARE FORESHORTENED AND DO NOT REPRESENT THEIR TRUE LENGTH. REFER TO THE PLAN DRAWINGS FOR THE LENGTHS OF STRUCTURES.





Samuel C. Holladay AIA

Sheet No.





	58) 24	
	8	
		/
		-
- DRYWALL FINISH ON WOOD BLOCKING - TYP.		
- CUSTOM WOOD SHELVING - TYP.		\setminus
- DRYWALL FINISH OVER 2 X WOOD FRAMING - TYP.		
- VERTICAL WOOD BOARD SIDING IN PATTERN TO MATCH		
DRAWINGS	à.	
- CONCRETE SLAB OVER EXISTING SLAB - TYP.		
		~~~~
		****
- EXISTING CONCRETE SLAB - TYP.		
- NEW CONCRETE FOOTING @ STEEL COLUMN LOCATIONS BEYOND - TYP		

**RENOVATIONS & REMODELING TO** The Johann Fust Community Li Boca Grande, Florida

# BUILDING SECTION @ MEDIA LIBRARY

		Copyright Seibert Architects, P.A. All Rights Reserved 20
ibrary		Date: MARCH 26, 2012 A5.0
	Samuel C. Holladay AIA	Sheet No.



- COPPER GUTTER - TYP.

MODIFIED BITUMEN ROOF SYSTEM OVER TAPERED RIGID INSULATION ON 5" THICK TONGUE & GROOVE WOOD DECKING - TYP.



# HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM SPECIAL

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** 

Lee County Planning Division, PO Box 398, Fort Myers, FL 33902 Phone: (239) 533-8585 / FAX: (239) 485-8319

COA No. 2011 - 0014 Designation No. HD 90.05.01 Date Filed: MARCH 2012
Contributing Non-Contributing Individual Designation Not Historical
Name of Project: Gilcrest LLC
Location: 331 Gilchrist Ave, BocaGrande
STRAP No.: 14-43-20-01-00017.0100
Name of Applicant or Agent*: Duferbridge Construction Inc. (*All correspondence with regards to the Certificate of Appropriateness will be sent to the party identified above)
Address: 2800 Placida Road #107
City, State, Zip: Englewood FL 34224
City, State, Zip: <u>Englewood FL 34224</u> Phone Number: <u>(941) 697-4644</u> Fax Number: <u>(941) 697-4605</u>
Email Address: <u>alicia · prestone embargmuil.com</u>
Email Address: <u>Alicia · prestone embargmuil·com</u> Name of Historic District (if applicable): <u>Boca Grande</u>
Check all that apply: 🕅 Building 🛛 Archaeological Site 🗌 Object 🖾 Landscape Feature
Project Description (describe all work proposed): Alteration Demolition X New Construction Reconstruction Rehabilitation Relocation Narrative: <u>Build new Single-family residence and pool crea</u> .
Change in Use: 🖾 No 🗌 Yes If yes, explain.
Does this use require a variance, special permit, or special exception under the Zoning Ordinance? 🛒 No 🗌 Yes If yes, explain.
Has a development order or exemption been applied for prior to or concurrent with this application? 📈 No 🗌 Yes If yes, explain.
**** FOR STAFF USE ONLY *****
Date Issued:
Certified by:

*Explanation attached

COA2011-00141, 331 Gilchrist Ave. Boca Grande – 14-43-20-01-00017.0100



COA2011-00141, 331 Gilchrist Ave. Boca Grande – 14-43-20-01-00017.0100





Copyright ©2011 Pictometry International Corp.

SUBJECT LOT


1 N



-> N

#### BOCA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD STAFF REPORT

TYPE OF CASE: Special Certificate of Appropriateness

CASE NUMBER: COA 2011 - 00141 Gilchrist LLC 331 Gilchrist St Boca Grande Fl 33921

#### HEARING DATE: April 11, 2012

#### **SUMMARY**

The subject property is a non-contributing property in the Boca Grande Historic District HD 90-05-01. Staff analyzed the proposed project for compliance with the Boca Grande Design Guidelines. The STRAP number is: 14-43-20-01-00017.0100; the address is: 331 Gilchrist Ave, Boca Grande, Fl. The proposed project entails the new construction of a single family residence at the corner of Gilchrist Ave and 3rd St W.

#### STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject parcel is a vacant lot (roughly 87-ft x 100-ft) at the northwest corner of the  $3^{rd}$  St and Gilchrest Ave. The lot has roughly 100-ft frontage on Gilchrist Ave and roughly 87-ft on  $3^{rd}$  St. Vehicular access will be limited to  $3^{rd}$  St where a double garage will be located just west of the proposed residence. This is a peculiar lot as the V-zone terminates in the western portion of the lot. As a result construction to the west of the V-zone line will have to meet V-zone elevation standards and construction to the east of that line will have to meet A-zone elevations standards.

The proposed garage will be built west of the line and will meet V-zone standards. The house will be built east of the line meet A-zone standards.

#### Square Footage Information about the proposed house

The total square footage of the house is 4,482 sq ft and of that 2,964 sq ft is under A/C. The balance includes a garage and a variety of porches.

	Total Square Footage of the House						
	A/C SF	Non A/C SF (detached garage)	Non A/C SF front porch & rear lanai	Total SF			
First Floor	1,760		1,000	2,760			
Second Floor	1,204			1,204			
Garage		518					
Total	2,964	518	1,000	4,482			

#### **The Proposed House**

<u>Garage and Pool in the V-zone</u>: To deal with the design constraints posed by a lot that straddles flood zones, the applicant proposes to build a detached garage to V-zone construction standards on the western section of the lot. The garage will have a footprint of roughly 23-ft by 23-ft and a height of roughly 14 ½ ft from grade to roof peak. The garage will feature a metal hip roof and horizontal hardiplank siding. It will be setback roughly 5-ft from the west side property line and 26-ft from the front property line on 3rd St. Since the house will be setback 20-ft from the front property line, the proposed garage will be recessed beyond the house. This treatment is in keeping with the design guidelines which tend to avoid highlighting garages. Directly behind the garage will be an elevated pool and deck. The pool and deck will be roughly 45-ft long and 21-ft wide. S:\HISTORIC\SCA\2012\bghpb\4112012\COA 2011-00141 Gilchirst LLC 331 Gilchrist St\COA2011 00141 Gilchrist LLC 331 Gilchrist St Boca Grande Staff Report.docx

<u>Two story single family house in the A-zone:</u> The proposed house is a two-story contemporary house with elements of the Colonial Revival style and of the existing historic cottages in the district. It will feature a horizontal hardiplank siding. On the second floor the house will feature a metal hip roof with a shed dormer on the front elevation. The design of the house is traditional and symmetrical. The first floor will feature a partial hip roof over the wide wrap-around porch. All windows will have decorative multiple lights and decorative shutters. Excluding the garage the footprint of the first floor will be roughly 2,760 sq ft: 1760 in air conditioned space and 1,000 sq ft in porches and lanais.

This building will be constructed in the A-zone and have a maximum height of roughly 33-ft from existing grade to roof peak. In the A-zone the building will have to be elevated roughly  $4\frac{1}{2}$  ft from existing grade or about  $3\frac{1}{2}$  ft from finished grade.

The house will have roughly 72 ft frontage on Gilchrist Ave. and roughly 33-ft on  $3^{rd}$  St W and be setback roughly 20 ft from the front property line on both streets. On the Gilchrist Ave (east) elevation on the first floor the house will have a long (roughly 62-ft) 6-ft wide, open porch that will wrap around the north side elevation for the length of the house on  $3^{rd}$  St W. The porch will feature a metal, partial hip roof supported by decorative columns and a railing with straight balusters.

The front elevation (east elevation) on Gilchrist Ave. the porch will be accessed by incised steps leading to a pair of French Doors recessed into the building. The French Doors will have light surrounds. As noted the front porch is roughly 62-ft long and does not run the full length of the front elevation (which is roughly 72-ft). The second story is roughly centered over the front porch – each window on the second floor is over a window on the first floor -- except of the central window which is over the first floor entrance. This design minimizes the impact of the full façade on Gilchrist Ave. by highlighting a façade that is 62-ft long instead of the full 72-ft.

On 3rd St W. (south side elevation) the second floor will feature a single window which is centered above the two windows on the first floor. The porch runs the length of the south elevation and terminates with a set of side stairs incised under the porch. The north side is similar to the south side except it lacks the porch. Like the south side, north side features a single window centered above the two windows on the first floor.

On the rear (west) elevation the first floor will feature a series of French Doors opening to a porch under a partial metal hip roof and then to the raised pool deck and pool. The second floor will feature two single windows flanked on each side by a pair of windows.

Overall staff believes this is a well thought out project that is in keeping with the design guidelines of the Boca Grande Historic District. This contemporary Colonial Revival building appears to be well suited to this corner, which is one of the most visible corners in the district.

#### Design Guidelines for the Boca Grande Historic District.

In evaluating the project also refer to the discussion above.

#### **1.0 Streetscape**

## **1.1** Building heights should be similar to the range of heights already found in the district and on the particular block of the subject structure.

While the house is roughly 33-ft high from existing grade to roof peak, there are various design elements that minimize the impact the height on the streetscape. By bringing in fill to the site the

mass of the building will be minimized. Additionally while the roof heights are measured to the roof peaks, the prevailing height will be lower as these hip roofs tapper to lower heights at eaves. Also the second floor roof is smaller than the first floor as it is does not cover the entire first floor. The first story porch is covered by a partial hip roof with adds a strong horizontal element. The house provides front facades for Gilchrist Ave and 3rd St W. By including a detached garage of low height, and recessed farther from the street setback than the house, applicant successfully minimized the impact of the garage on the street. In general the proposed design is in keeping with the range of heights and building masses already found in the district and on this particular block.

# 1.2 The pattern of spaces between buildings should be maintained. Additions to existing buildings should be set back from the front façade so the visual quality of spacing is preserved. Maintain traditional pattern setbacks, entrances and alignment of facades. Maintain traditional yard spaces and sense of openness, especially at the front and sides of buildings.

The proposed house is a contemporary Colonial Revival house whose design if in keeping with the traditional pattern of setbacks, entrances and alignment of facades.

# 1.3 Additions should attempt to maintain the overall sense of size of the building. $\rm N/A$ 1.4 Buildings at the ends of a block should be similar in height to the buildings, or provide a visual transition to the next block. $\rm N/A$

# **1.5** The traditional alignment of horizontal and vertical elements of buildings along a block should be maintained. The alignment of first and second story windows should respect traditional patterns of the block.

This house is a contemporary house which has kept the traditional alignment of horizontal and vertical elements.

#### 1.6 Maintain the traditional proportions of glass in building facades.

The proposal calls for traditional sized windows and French doors (typical of the district).

#### **1.7** Maintain the traditional alignment between rooflines, porch protrusions and entrances.

The proposal maintains the traditional alignment between rooflines, porch protrusions and entrances. The building presents a complexity of mass and height in order to minimize the impact of the proposed building and maintain a traditional alignment.

#### 2.0 Building Site

# **2.1** Identify, retain and preserve features that are important in defining the overall historical character of the site, including driveways, walkways, lighting, fencing, signage, benches, fountains, terraces, water features, vegetation and potential archaeological features.

The principal feature of this site is that it is located at the corner of Gilchrist Ave and  $3^{rd}$  St W. This is one of the most visible corners in the district. A contemporary Colonial Revival house with wrap around porches appears to fit in nicely with the character of the district in this location. The house provides front facades to both Gilchrist Ave and  $3^{rd}$  St W.

By including a detached garage of low height, applicant successfully minimized the mass of the house on 3rd St.

# **2.2 Maintain the traditional orientation patterns of building facades to the street or water. The front of the building should present a façade that is parallel to the street on which it faces.** The proposed building maintains the traditional orientation

# **2.3** The vertical and horizontal proportions of building mass should be maintained. Additions should preserve or maintain the traditional symmetry of the buildings front façade.

The vertical and horizontal proportions of the building mass are maintained. The traditional symmetry of the Colonial buildings is maintained.

# **2.4** Maintain traditional setback patterns. Porches, decks, solid fences or other additions should be located to respect traditional patterns or visually preserve the traditional front setback. Additions or screened service areas should be located to the side or rear of the front setback.

The proposed building with its porches maintains a 20-ft setback from Gilchrist Ave and 3rd St. The proposed porch is a traditional wraparound porch and visually preserves the traditional front setback.

2.5 Alleys, where part of the historical plat, should be used to provide access to the rear of properties for parking and service. Parking and access to parking should relate to alley systems, where present, and should be limited to the rear of structures where this pattern is traditional. N/A

# 2.6 Accessory buildings such as garages or carports should be located according to the traditional development patterns of such buildings and should relate to the existing building on the site. Service areas and trash containers should be screened from view using fences, lattice screens or hedges.

The garage will be setback roughly 26-ft from the front property line on 3rd St. Since the house will be setback 20-ft from the front property line, the proposed garage will be recessed beyond the house. This treatment is in keeping with the design guidelines which tend to avoid highlighting garages.

2.7 Decks should be an unobtrusive as possible. Railing should express a line and spacing similar to existing balustrades. The duplication of historic styles such as widow's walks should be encouraged only where this type of architecture was traditionally found. The proposed pool deck is at the rear of the property and not visible from the street.

2.8 Paving materials and patterns should respect traditional patterns on the block. N/A 2.9 Landscaping should respect traditional planting patterns and maintain the alignment, spacing, and type where possible.  $\rm N/A$ 

#### **3.0 Additions to Existing Buildings**

3.1 Additions should be compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the building and its environment. Additions may include porches and bay windows as well as entire wings and rooms. N/A

3.2 Additions should be positioned so they do not alter the historic rhythm of building fronts.  $N\!/\!A$ 

#### 4.0 New Construction

## **4.1** Contemporary styles should be harmonious in form, material, and scale with the character of the block or district.

The proposed building is in a contemporary house that is harmonious in form and scale to the block or district. The house is a contemporary Colonial house featuring a metal roof and horizontal hardiplank siding. While the house is roughly 33-ft high from existing grade to roof peak, there are various design elements that minimize the impact the height on the streetscape. By bringing in fill to the site the mass of the building will be minimized. Additionally while the roof heights are

measured to the roof peaks, the prevailing height will be lower as these hip roofs tapper to lower heights at eaves. Also the second floor roof is smaller than the first floor as it is does not cover the entire first floor. The first story porch is covered by a partial hip roof with adds a strong horizontal element. The house provides front facades for Gilchrist Ave and 3rd St W. By including a detached garage of low height, and recessed farther from the street setback than the house, applicant successfully minimized the impact of the garage on the street.

#### 4.2 Align the façade of the building with the historic setbacks of the block or district.

Generally the 20-ft setback aligns with the historic setback of the block or district.

## **4.3** New buildings should appear similar in mass and scale with historic structures in the block or surrounding area.

As already noted, while the house is roughly 33-ft high from existing grade to roof peak, there are various design elements that minimize the impact the height on the streetscape. The proposed building appears to be similar in mass and scale to the historic structures in the block or the surrounding area.

#### 4.4 Building and roof forms should match those used historically.

The proposed building is a contemporary Colonial eclectic building which is similar to the Colonial buildings found in the district. The main roof is a metal hip roof with secondary partial hip roofs over the porch and the lanai. The roofs are similar to those found historically.

#### 4.5 Use similar building materials to those used historically for all major surfaces.

The proposed materials are metal roofs and horizontal hardiplank siding – both are found in the district especially in the new construction.

## **4.6** Use window sizes and proportions similar to those used historically. To create larger surfaces of glass, consider combining several standard windows in a row.

The window sizes used are typical of those used historically. To create larger surfaces of glass the proposal uses several windows in a row or French Doors.

#### 5.0 Relocating Buildings in a Historic District

5.1 Relocate the structure in a context similar to its historic location, if relocating a historic building.  $N\!/\!A$ 

5.2 Align the building within the historic patterns of setbacks and open space ratios.  $\rm N/A$  5.3 Orient the building according to the traditional pattern of the block or district.  $\rm N/A$ 

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Boca Grande Historic Preservation Board:

- Approve the project as presented by the applicant.
- Make a finding that the proposed project has been designated under Chapter 22 of the Land Development Code and on the basis of staff analysis, the project is in compliance with Chapter 22, and the design guidelines of the Boca Grande Historic District.

#### COA2011-00141, 331 Gilchrist Ave. Boca Grande 14-43-20-01-00017.0100



Subject lot at the corner of 3rd St. W and Gilchrist Ave.

#### Adjoining house to the West





Adjoining property to the North

#### COA2011-00141, 331 Gilchrist Ave. Boca Grande 14-43-20-01-00017.0100



Vacant lot across 3rd St. W from the subject lot

Methodist Church across Gilchrist Ave from the subject lot





Houses diagonally across Gilchrist Ave from the subject lot







*RENDERINGS SHOWN ARE CONCEPTUAL - SEE BUILDING ELEVATIONS



#### E Χ T

### ARCHITECTURAL

- T-1 INDEX
- A-1 FIRST FLOOR PLAN
- A-2 SECOND FLOOR PLAN & SECTION
- A-3 ELEVATIONS & GENERAL NOTES
- A-4 ELEVATIONS





DC	OOR SCHEDULE			
⊖ _{N^a}	DESCRIPTION	TYPE DOOR	SIZE	REMARKS
1	MARVIN STORMPLUS FRENCH	PRE-HUNG	6080	(2) STA. 12" SIDELIGHTS
2	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2680	
3	INTERIOR FRENCH	PRE-HUNG	4880	
4	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	
5	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	
6	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2880	
1	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	SLIDING DR	6080	
8	EXTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2880	OPT. DUTCH DR
9	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	BIFOLD DR	2680	
10	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	CAFE DR		PR 1'-6"X4'-0"
11	MARVIN STORMPLUS PRENCH	PRE-HUNG	6080	
12	MARVIN STORMPLUS FRENCH	PRE-HUNG	6080	
13	MARVIN STORMPLUS PRENCH	PRE-HUNG	6080	
14	MARVIN STORMPLUS FRENCH	PRE-HUNG	6080	
15	EXTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	
16	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2880	
П	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	
18	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	
19	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	POCKET DR	2480	
20	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	BIFOLD DR	2080	
21	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480	

MARV	N STORMPLUS IMPACT ZO	NE 3 CLADI		MAGNIM LOE-366
	G, STONE WHITE CLAD EX			
~		annon an an ann an Anna Anna an Anna Anna	1	1
$\bigcirc$	DESCRIPTION	QTY.	HEAD HEIGHT	REMARKS
Nº		<b>~</b>		
1	SH 265Ø	9	8'-Ø"	MEGR STANDARD MULL
2	SH 2650	1	8'-0"	TEMPERED
3	SH 2050	1	8'-0"	MEGR STANDARD MULL
4	20" × 30" FIX GLS	2	DORMER	MEGR STANDARD MULL



SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"

10'-92'

6-8

	9' CLG						B A-2		SH AS SL T4G PL' ILED W/I LOOR EL OISTS •
		DC	OR SCHEDULE				WINE	DOW SCHEDU	LE
		⊖ №ª	DESCRIPTION	TYPE DOOR	SIZE	REMARKS	MARVI W/ ARC	N STORMPLUS IMPACT ; , STONE WHITE CLAD E	ZONE 3
A N		1	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2880		$\cap$	DESCRIPTION	
		2	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG PRE-HUNG	248Ø 248Ø		Nº		
	I	4	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480		1	SH 2650 SH 2636	
		5	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2080				
		1	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG PRE-HUNG	268Ø 288Ø			LASS VISIBLE FROM	
		8	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	BIFOLD DR	2280			IDE AN INSIDE-TO-( % OR LESS	JUISI
		9	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480				
		10	INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2480				
			INTERIOR 5 PANEL WOOD	PRE-HUNG	2880				

. 16' 0.0





SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"

	GENERAL NOTES
	1. ROOF DESIGN LIVE LOAD 20 P.S.F. FLOOR DESIGN LIVE LOAD 40 P.S.F.
4	BASIC WIND SPEED DESIGN 130 M.P.H. BUILDING CATEGORY II, IMPORTANCE FACTOR = 1, EXPOSURE 'C'
	ENCLOSED STRUCTURE, INTERNAL PRESSURE DESIGN PER A.S.C.E. 7-05 , q=310 P.S.F. INTERNAL PRESSURE COEFFICIENT = +18
	WIND BORNE DEBRIG REGION ALL GLAZING SHALL BE IMPACT RESISTANT OR
	PROTECTED BY APPROVED SHUTTERS DESIGN PRESSURES FOR WINDOWS & DOORS
	FIRST FLOOR WINDOWS
	SECOND FLOOR
	WINDOWS
	ROOF TRUSS & GIRDER UPLIFTS PER APPROVED MFGR'S DRAWINGS 2. EXTERIOR WALL SEGMENTS SHOWN SHADED ARE SHEAR WALL SEGMENTS CONSIDERED.
	<ol> <li>ALL FOOTINGS SHALL BEAR ON FIRM, UNDISTURBED SOIL, OR CLEAN FILL COMPACTED TO 95% STANDARD PROCTOR.</li> <li>DESIGN SOIL PRESSURE2,000 P.S.F.</li> </ol>
33-21	5. ALL CONCRETE SHALL ACHIEVE A MINIMUM COMPRESSIVE STRENGTH OF 3,000 P.S.I. # 28 DAYS (2,500 P.S.I. FOR SLABS)
	UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE ON PLANS OR DETAILS MORTAR SHALL BE TYPE "M" OR "S" 6. REINFORCING STEEL TO BE ASTM A-615 GR 40.
	UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE. 7. PLACE ALL CONCRETE AND REINFORCING IN ACCORDANCE
	WITH THE LATEST ACI CODE OF STANDARD PRACTICE. 8. JAMBS · OPENINGS · 6' SHALL BE FILLED SOLID AND REINFORCED WITH 1-*5 UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE
	9. MASONRY WALLS OVER 10' HIGH TO BE BRACED IN ACCORDANCE W/ THE "STANDARD PRACTICE FOR BRACING MASONRY WALLS UNDER CONSTRUCTION" OR PROVIDE AN EVACUATION ROUTE PER THE ABOVE STANDARD
	10. PRECAST CONCRETE LINTELS SHALL HAVE THE FOLLOWING MINIMUM SAFE LOAD CAPACITIES UNFILLED:
	SPANS TO 4'-8'1,184 PLF. SPANS TO 8'-8'573 PLF. SPANS TO 10'-8'445 PLF.
	SPANS TO 13'-4"338 PLF. FOR SPANS > 13'-4" LINTELS SHALL HAVE THE FOLLOWING MINIMUM SAFE (SUPERIMPOSED) LOAD CAPACITIES, FILLED 11/ 32/2020 PAL 11/1 TO PERAD
	FILLED W/ 3,000 P.S.I. W/1-#5 REBAR SPANS TO 14 FT465 P.L.F. SPANS TO 16'-8"310 P.L.F. SPANS TO 20'-8"183 P.L.F.
E D. v	SPANS TO 23'-4" 130 PLF. LINTELS SHALL BEAR MANUFACTURER'S NAME & CAPACITY 11. ALL FRAMING LUMBER SHALL BE DOUG-FIR 5-P-F, OR 5. PINE,
	-GRADE 2 OR BETTER W/ 1621000 P.S.I. (BEARING HEADERS & EXTERIOR WALL FRG ONLY)
	<ol> <li>MICROLAM BEAMS SHALL BE AS MANUFACTURED BY "TRUSS JOIST" OR APPROVED EQUAL: E≥ 2800 P.S.I., E&gt; 2000,000 P.S.I.</li> <li>MINIMUM PRE-FABRICATED TRUSS DESIGN LOADS TO BE:</li> </ol>
	TOP CHORD LIVE LOAD 30 P.S.F. TOP CHORD DEAD LOAD 15 P.S.F. BOTTOM CHORD
	TOTAL 55 P.S.F. 14. UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE ON THESE PLANS -
	ROOF UPLIFT DESIGN LOADS SHALL BE AS NOTED ON APPROVED TRUSS MFGR'S 16. DRAWINGS. ROOF TRUSS AND GIRDER ANCHORS TO BE IN ACCORDANCE W/ THE FOLLOWING SCHEDULE, USE PRODUCTS OF "USP" INSTALL IN
	ACCORDANCE W/ MFGR'S SPECIFICATIONS THE FOLLOWING: TYPES: UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE ON PLAN MODEL FASTENERS ALLOWABLE UPLIFT
	FRAME: RTIGA 9-10d X   1/2" 1380 LBS + 8-10d 15. ROOFING MATERIAL & FASTENING TO BE IN ACCORDANCE W/ MFGR'S SPECIFICATIONS
	(CONTRACTOR TO SUPPLY) 16. LOAD BEARING HEADER STUD REQUIREMENTS:
	FOR SPANS TO 6'-0" USE ONE HEADER STUD WITH 2 FULL LENGTH STUDS FOR SPANS GREATER THAN 6'-0" USE 2 HEADER STUDS WITH 3 FULL LENGTH STUDS FOR UPLIFT REQ'TS STUD TO SLAB/FOUNDATION: USE 'USP' HTTIG FOR LOADS LESS THAN 3250 LBS, W/ IS-10d
	USE 'USP' HTTIG FOR LOADS LESS THAN 4290 LBS. W/ 18-16d 17. FOR TRUSS/GIRDER CONNECTION TO STUD WALLS UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE:
	USE 'USP' RTIGT FOR LOADS LESS THAN 1225LBS. (MAX. 2 PER STUD) (W/14-16d TOTAL) USE 'USP' HTW20 FOR LOADS LESS THAN 1530 LBS. (MAX. 2 PER STUD) (W/24-10dx1 1/2*) 18. UNLESS SPECIFIED BY MFGR: FASTEN P.T. BUCKS FOR EXTERIOR DOORS, WINDOWS, 4
	SLIDING GL. DOORS INTO MASONRY AS FOLLOWS: FOR IX MATERIAL: 3/16" "TAP-CON" THRU WINDOW FRAME INTO MASONRY (MIN. 1-1/2" EMBEDM'T). SPACE @ 6" FROM CORNERS & 24" O.C. MAX.
	OR PER WINDOW MANUFACTURERS INSTALL REQM'IS BUCK REQUIRED @ HEAD + JAMBS & MUST EXTEND PAST INTERIOR WINDOW FRAME FOR 2X MATERIAL: 1/4" TAP-CONS @ 6" FROM CORNERS & 16" O.C.
	MIN. 1-1/2" EMBEDM'T INTO MAGONRY 19. WINDOWS BY: PGT EXTERIOR DOORS BY: PGT OR THERMA-TRU
	ALL WINDOW & DOOR FASTENING TO BE IN ACCORDANCE W/ MANUFACTURERS SPECIFICATIONS.
	ALUM. MULLIONS TO BE INSTALLED PER MFGR'S SPEC'S. SEE ENGINEERED SHOP DRAWINGS BY MFGR. 20. EPOXY SET THREADED RODS & REINFORCING SHALL BE SET WITH
	'SIMPSON ET' IN ACCORDANCE WITH MANUFACTURERS SPECIFICATIONS FOR FULL DEVELOPMENT BASED UPON ALLOWABLE STEEL STRENGTH 21. TERMITE PROTECTION TO BE COMPLIANT WITH 2007 FBC -SOIL PROTEC-
	TO EXTEND 12" BEYOND EXTERIOR WALLS OF STRUCTURE. 22. ALL CONDENSATE LINES AND ROOF DOWNSPOUTS SHALL DISCHARGE MIN. 12" AWAY FROM STRUCTURE SIDEWALL USING UNDERGROUND PIPING,
	TAIL EXTENSIONS OR SPLASH BLOCKS 23. ALL RECEPTACLES NOT REQUIRED TO BE GFI SHALL BE ARC FAULT PROTECTED PER NEC 2008- 210.12. ALL RECEPTACLES TO BE
	TAMPER PROOF WHERE REQUIRED BY NEC 2008- 406.11. 24. FOR ANY MIS-PLACED TRUSS STRAPS IN MASONRY, revisions:
	MODEL FASTENERS ALLOWABLE UPLIFT 3-29-12 USP RTIGT (3) 3/16" TAPCONS 920 LBS.
	USP RT24T (5) 3/16" TAPCONS 1530 LBS. • OR EQUIVALENT SIMPSON PRODUCT • INSTALL ALL CONNECTORS IN ACCORDANCE
	W/ MANUFACTURER' SPECIFICATIONS 25. PROVIDE "CARBON MONOXIDE ALARM" WITHIN 10' OF EACH BEDROOM.
	date: 120-12
	La krebs job no. 2154
	NEW RESIDENCE FOR: OUTERBRIDGE CONSTRUCTION Edgewater Ctr. suite4A
	1460 McCall Rd. S Englewood, Fla. 34223 drawing:
	331 GILCRHIST AVE. BOCA GRANDE, FL (941)475-7327





#### HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM SPECIAL

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** 

Lee County Planning Division, PO Box 398, Fort Myers, FL 33902 Phone: (239) 533-8585 / FAX: (239) 485-8319

COA No. COA ZO	2-00026 Designation No.	90-05-0 Date Filed	MARCH ZUIZ
Contributing	Non-Contributing	Individual Designation	Not Historical
Name of Project:	Middle Third LLC.		
	3rd Street West, Boca		
	14-43-20-01-00017.00		
	r Agent*: Duter bridge C regards to the Certificate of Appropriateness		)
Address:	2800 Placida Road #10		
City, State, Zip:	Englewood FL 3422	4	
Phone Number:	(941) 697-4644	Fax Number: (94)	097-4605_
Email Address:	alicia. preston e er	nbaramail.com	
Name of Historic Dis	trict (if applicable): <u>Boca G</u>	rande .	
	⊠ Building □Archaeologic		
	Demolition Demolition Model existing Cottage ral 2-bedroom 2-bath		
Change in Use: 🕅 N	lo 🗍 Yes		
Does this use require	e a variance, special permit, or spec	ial exception under the Zoning O	rdinance? 🕺 No 🗌 Yes
	order or exemption been applied for		oplication? 🖄 No 🗌 Yes
If yes, explain.			
n-			
	***** FOR STAF	FF USE ONLY * * * * *	
Date Issued:			PROVED
Certified by:			

*Explanation attached





Subject Property 307 W 3rd St.



Copyright ©2011 Pictometry International Corp.

SUBTELT PROPERTY

#### BOCA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD STAFF REPORT

TYPE OF CASE: Special Certificate of Appropriateness

CASE NUMBER: COA 2012-00026 Middle Third LLC, 307 3rd St Boca Grande, Boca Grande Fl

#### HEARING DATE: April 11, 2012

#### **SUMMARY**

This proposal calls for the remodeling of an existing house, an expansion of that house and the addition of a pool. This is an existing non-contributing, house in the Boca Grande Historic District HD (District) 90-05-01. The residence is located at 307 West 3rd St., Boca Grande FL 33921 (STRAP: 14 43 20 01 00017.0090). Staff analyzed the proposed project for compatibility with the Design Guidelines for the Boca Grande Historic District.

#### STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject parcel is roughly 91-ft by 100-ft with 100-ft frontage on 3rd St W. It has an existing one story, single family house located on it. This is a peculiar lot as the 1991 Lee County Coastal Construction line bisects this lot. As a result new construction is allowed westward of this line only with a permit from DEP. DEP does not require a permit for rehabilitation of existing structures provided the rehabilitation does not exceed 50% of the value of the building. Eastward of this line construction is allowed as long as it meets the requirements of the V-zone; in this particular lot the V-zone requires the finished first floor of a house be roughly 12-ft above the existing grade.

To deal with these design constraints the applicant proposes a split level, single family house. The existing house with a footprint of roughly 1,200 sq ft will be preserved and rehabilitated as the cabana/garage wing at ground level. It will accommodate a two car garage and cabana with an office, a bathroom for access from the swimming pool and a recreation room. Next to it would be the new V-zone wing (built in compliance with V-zone regulations) and would have a footprint of roughly 2000 sq ft. There will be no living areas at the lower level. The lower level will include the foyer, the elevator, storage and a screened lanai. At the upper level will be the living areas.

The existing banyan tree would be preserved on the site and a pool would be built at the rear of the lot. A brick pool deck would surround the tree, connecting the cabana, the screened lanai and the pool.

Total Square Footage of the House							
	A/C SF	Garage/Stor age SF	Porches Lanai SF	Foyer SF	Total SF		
Cabana/Garage wing	677	519			1,196		
Lower level V-zone wing		400	1,303	175	1,878		
Upper level V-zone wing	1,878		174		2,052		
Total	2,555	919	1,477	175	5,126		

#### Square Footage Information about the proposed house

#### **The Proposed House**

The proposed house is a split level house with a contemporary design and elements of the existing historic cottages in the district. It will feature a horizontal hardiplank siding, a variety of metal hip roofs with "broken" eaves and exposed decorative rafter tails, windows with multiple lights and French doors opening to the brick pool deck and pool area.

The proposed house has a total of roughly 80-ft fronting on  $3^{rd}$  St W. The impact of the house on the street frontage is minimized because the façade is broken into several receding and protruding wings and features variable roof heights.

<u>Cabana/Garage wing</u>: The existing house will be rehabbed into the cabana/garage wing. This will be roughly 15-ft high from grade to roof peak. It will have a frontage of roughly 38-ft. Roughly 26-ft of the frontage is for the two car garage which is setback about 8-ft from the street. The remaining 12-ft will accommodate a recreation room which is setback about 15-ft from the street.

<u>The V-zone wing</u>: The V-zone wing is east of the cabana/garage wing and have a maximum height of roughly 33-ft high from existing grade to roof peak. However the impact of this height will be minimized by multiple roofs.

It will have a frontage of roughly 41-ft. The central 22-ft will be under a secondary hip roofed wing setback about 26-ft from the street. The remaining area will have a street setback of roughly 29-ft.

To minimize the impact on the streetscape of elevating the house roughly 12-ft above existing grade, the applicant proposes to install a 50-ft long and 6-ft high, stucco wall fence. However, to minimize the impact of this fence on the street the applicant proposes to split it into two distinct 25-ft long segments. The eastern segment would be setback roughly 3-ft from the front property line and buffered by shrubs. The western segment would be setback roughly 16-ft from the front property line and include double wooden gates that would line up with the main foyer entrance on the lower level.

Overall staff believes this is a well thought out project that is in keeping with the design guidelines of the Boca Grande Historic District. The mass and scale of the house is broken up through variable heights that incorporate projecting and recessed areas.

#### Design Guidelines for the Boca Grande Historic District.

In evaluating the project also refer to the discussion above.

#### **1.0 Streetscape**

**1.1** Building heights should be similar to the range of heights already found in the district and on the particular block of the subject structure.

The proposal is to develop a split level house by making use of an existing house and turning it into a cabana/garage wing. Utilizing the existing building, which is relatively low to the ground, minimizes the overall height of the proposed house.

The area of the house with the living areas is built in the V-zone and has to be elevated roughly 12ft above existing grade for a total height of roughly 33-ft from existing grade to roof peak. The applicant minimized the impact of this height in the following manner:

• The applicant has incorporated multiple hip roofs with "broken eaves" to minimize the mass and scale of the building. It is important to remember that while the roof heights are measured to the roof peaks, the prevailing height will be lower as these hip roofs tapper to lower heights at eaves.

- The façade of the building in the V-zone is only roughly 40-ft and it is broken by a central secondary hip roofed wing.
- The façade of the building in the V-zone is setback from the front property line in a staggered fashion with the central area setback at 26-ft and the areas to its side setback at 29-ft from the property line.

In general the proposed design is in keeping with the range of heights and building masses already found in the district and on this particular block.

# 1.2 The pattern of spaces between buildings should be maintained. Additions to existing buildings should be set back from the front façade so the visual quality of spacing is preserved. Maintain traditional pattern setbacks, entrances and alignment of facades. Maintain traditional yard spaces and sense of openness, especially at the front and sides of buildings.

The proposal maintains the spaces between the buildings. The addition in the V-zone is setback from the front façade of the existing building so the visual quality of spacing is preserved. The addition maintains the traditional setbacks. The installation of the wall fence softens the impact of the building that is elevated to the V-zone. However the impact of this wall on the street is diminished as the wall is divided into two segments with variable setbacks.

#### 1.3 Additions should attempt to maintain the overall sense of size of the building.

Due to the constraints posed by the V-zone the new wing is much higher than the existing wing. However, by constructing a new wing with a relatively narrow façade (a roughly 40-ft) and by incorporating variable roof heights and setbacks the applicant was able to maintain the overall sense of building size.

## 1.4 Buildings at the ends of a block should be similar in height to the buildings, or provide a visual transition to the next block. $\rm N/A$

# **1.5** The traditional alignment of horizontal and vertical elements of buildings along a block should be maintained. The alignment of first and second story windows should respect traditional patterns of the block.

This house is a contemporary house which has kept the traditional alignment of horizontal and vertical elements.

#### 1.6 Maintain the traditional proportions of glass in building facades.

The proposal calls for traditional sized windows and French doors (typical of the district).

#### 1.7 Maintain the traditional alignment between rooflines, porch protrusions and entrances.

The proposal maintains the traditional alignment between rooflines, porch protrusions and entrances. The building presents a complexity of mass and height in order to minimize the impact of the proposed building and maintain a traditional alignment.

#### 2.0 Building Site

**2.1 Identify, retain and preserve features that are important in defining the overall historical character of the site, including driveways, walkways, lighting, fencing, signage, benches, fountains, terraces, water features, vegetation and potential archaeological features.** The applicant proposes to preserve the banyan tree at the site. The applicant also preserved the existing building and incorporated it as one of the wings of the split level house.

#### 2.2 Maintain the traditional orientation patterns of building facades to the street or water.

The front of the building should present a façade that is parallel to the street on which it faces. The proposed split level building maintains the traditional orientation pattern of building facades to the street. The front of the building presents a façade that is parallel to the street.

## **2.3** The vertical and horizontal proportions of building mass should be maintained. Additions should preserve or maintain the traditional symmetry of the buildings front façade.

The vertical and horizontal proportions of the building mass are maintained. The addition preserves the traditional symmetry of the building. The proposal features: variable setbacks along the street to create a building that is compatible with the traditional symmetry.

# **2.4** Maintain traditional setback patterns. Porches, decks, solid fences or other additions should be located to respect traditional patterns or visually preserve the traditional front setback. Additions or screened service areas should be located to the side or rear of the front setback.

The plan preserves the setback of the existing building. The new wing in the V-zone will be recessed farther from the road but still in keeping with the traditional setback patterns.

2.5 Alleys, where part of the historical plat, should be used to provide access to the rear of properties for parking and service. Parking and access to parking should relate to alley systems, where present, and should be limited to the rear of structures where this pattern is traditional. N/A

2.6 Accessory buildings such as garages or carports should be located according to the traditional development patterns of such buildings and should relate to the existing building on the site. Service areas and trash containers should be screened from view using fences, lattice screens or hedges. N/A

2.7 Decks should be an unobtrusive as possible. Railing should express a line and spacing similar to existing balustrades. The duplication of historic styles such as widow's walks should be encouraged only where this type of architecture was traditionally found. The pool and deck are located to the rear of the building.

2.8 Paving materials and patterns should respect traditional patterns on the block. N/A 2.9 Landscaping should respect traditional planting patterns and maintain the alignment, spacing, and type where possible.  $\rm N/A$ 

#### 3.0 Additions to Existing Buildings

**3.1** Additions should be compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the building and its environment. Additions may include porches and bay windows as well as entire wings and rooms.

Within the constraints of construction in a V-zone the addition is compatible with the size, material and character of the existing building and its environment.

#### **3.2** Additions should be positioned so they do not alter the historic rhythm of building fronts.

Because the addition is relatively narrow and setback from the existing building, it does not alter the historic rhythm of building fronts.

#### 4.0 New Construction

## **4.1** Contemporary styles should be harmonious in form, material, and scale with the character of the block or district.

The proposed building is in a contemporary house that is harmonious in form and scale to the block or district. The roof material is metal. The wall material is horizontal wood composite siding.

The building heights range from roughly 15-ft from grade to roof peak of the existing wing to roughly 33-ft from existing grade to roof peak of the proposed wing. The two wings are compatible as they relatively narrow and the taller wing has variable roofs and a façade that incorporates protruding and receding areas.

#### 4.2 Align the façade of the building with the historic setbacks of the block or district.

In general the façade of the building is aligned with the historic setbacks of the block or district.

## **4.3** New buildings should appear similar in mass and scale with historic structures in the block or surrounding area.

The proposed new wing appears to be similar in mass and scale to the historic structures in the block or the surrounding area. Within the constraints of construction in a V-zone the addition is compatible with the size, material and character of the existing building and its environment.

#### 4.4 Building and roof forms should match those used historically.

The roof is metal. There are hip roofs of variable heights on the building. This complexity of roof masses is typical of the roofs found in the district.

#### 4.5 Use similar building materials to those used historically for all major surfaces.

The proposed materials are metal roofs and horizontal hardiplank siding – both are found in the district especially in the new construction.

## **4.6** Use window sizes and proportions similar to those used historically. To create larger surfaces of glass, consider combining several standard windows in a row.

The window sizes used are typical of those used historically. To create larger surfaces of glass the proposal uses several windows in a row or French Doors.

#### 5.0 Relocating Buildings in a Historic District

5.1 Relocate the structure in a context similar to its historic location, if relocating a historic building.  $N\!/\!A$ 

5.2 Align the building within the historic patterns of setbacks and open space ratios.  $\rm N/A$  5.3 Orient the building according to the traditional pattern of the block or district.  $\rm N/A$ 

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Boca Grande Historic Preservation Board:

- Approve the project as presented by the applicant.
- Make a finding that the proposed project has been designated under Chapter 22 of the Land Development Code and on the basis of staff analysis, the project is in compliance with Chapter 22, and the design guidelines of the Boca Grande Historic District.



Subject property side (West) elevation

Subject property with existing single family house front (South) elevation





# Subject property rear (North) elevation

Subject property side (East) elevation





Adjoining property to the West

# Adjoining property to the West and streetscape





Adjoining vacant lot to the East (corner of 3rd St and Gilchrist Ave)



Property across 3rd St from subject property



Vacant lot across 3rd St from subject property



# 307 W. 3rd street Outerbridge Construction T.A. Krebs Architect inc





*RENDERINGS SHOWN ARE CONCEPTUAL - SEE BUILDING ELEVATIONS



#### D R G ARCHITECTURAL T-1 INDEX & SITE PLAN A-1 LOWER LEVEL FLOOR PLAN A-2 FIRST FLOOR PLAN A-3 ELEVATIONS A-4 ELEVATIONS



	co
LOWER LEV	EL
CABANA	
UPPER FLOC	R
TOTAL ARE	А
LOT AREA	
BLDG FOOTPF	RINT
LOT COVERA	GE





LIVING	= 1878 SQFT.
LANAI	= 174 SQFT.

REMARKS	

PGT WI	INDGUARD VINYL SH 50% , TURTLE	9, IMPACT CLE	AR GLASS,	
∩ N ^a	DESCRIPTION	QTY.	HEAD HEIGHT	REMARKS
1	SH 2Ø52	2	8'-0'	
2	SH 2040	1	8'-0"	
3	SH 3450	1	8'-0"	TEMPERED
4	SH 3060	2	8'-0"	4" FRAME MULL
5	SH 2444	2	8'-0"	TEMPERED
6	SH 2860	4	8'-0"	8" FRAME MULL
٦	SH 2446	1	8'-0'	
8	SH 2856	1	8'-0'	
9	SH 1862	1	8'-0'	
10	SH 3060	2	8'-0'	MER STANDARD MULL

VERIFY ALL WOW & DOOR RO. REQ'S W/ MFGRS SPECIFICATIONS OPERABLE WINDOWS LOCATED HIGHER THAN 72" ABOVE GRADE HAVE A MIN. SILL HEIGHT OF 24" PER 2001 F.B.C. R6132

	Į	E	L 18.	92'	N
.701					
	LOU	ER	LEV EL	/EL 8.1	FI 5'

TRUSS BRG







WEST ELEVATION SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"

OPERABLE WINDOWS LOCATED HIGHER THAN 12' ABOVE GRADE HAVE A MIN. SILL HEIGHT OF 24' PER 2007 F.B.C. R613.2



1.0

